

Erotic Transgression and The Allure of Innocent Woman: Analysis on Hijab Pornography in a Muslim-majority Country

Ahmad Naufalul Umam^{1*} & Istiqomah²

^{1,2}Faculty of Psychology, Universitas Mercu Buana

E-mail: ¹ahmad.naufalul@mercubuana.ac.id, ²istiqomah@mercubuana.ac.id

*Corresponding Author

Abstract. There is a sub-culture of hijab erotica in a country where hijab used to be a symbol of rebellion against the oppressive regime and became a conservative norm in a conservative-leaning society that rejects pornography. Researcher gathered erotic stories from an internet forum involving the characters of hijabi women as the main character. Through thematic analysis, researcher found several key themes in the stories. The themes are the identity of hijabi women as both familiar and exotic, the erotic transgression in sexual acts, the allure of innocent women, and hijab as a significant accessory in sexual intercourse. The result of this research strengthens the notion of pornography as an everchanging historical record that caught the nuance of how people view sex and its expression in any particular era of interest.

Keywords: *hijab, pornography, transgression*

Introduction

Pornography has always been widely known to serve the purpose of creating or enhancing sexual arousal for the consumers (Hald & Malamuth, 2008). Among the vast numbers of genres in porn, there is a distinct cluster of genre that revolves around paraphilic objects (Hald & Stulhofer, 2015). But the emerging trend of hijab, the veil used by Muslim women, in pornography as a form of paraphilic object raises questions, because hijab was culturally intended to prevent male gaze and thus lowering the sexual arousal of men towards women (Ghumkhor, 2020). Utilizing an object that is identical with repression of sexual desire in pornography seems to be counterintuitive, but it had gained public's attention when it was out.

The issue of hijab in pornography has been brought to public since the production of infamous title of "Women of the Middle East" that portrayed veiled women as a tempting mystery for non-Muslims or Western audience in general, and once the veil has been taken off, they can enjoy sex as free as others (Madison, 2015). It was the first

feature-length hijabi and niqabi centered porno, and in an interview, Kelly Madison, the producer, thought that using hijab and niqab in her porno captured the unexposed beauty of Middle Eastern women in their life, and the porno is about taking the veil off as an attempt to hit the taboo with a hint of social commentary (Hay, 2015).

This fairly new kind of porn raised alarm to some academics. Abujad (2021) considered hijab pornography as a form of colonial fantasy, equally stereotyping the image of violent Muslim men as well as imagining liberating Muslim women from their sexual repression by engaging in sexual acts on screen. However, the idea of hijab pornography as colonial fantasy lost its relevancy when the pornography was being "In Indonesia, where pornography is illegal, the creation and consumption of hijab pornography take on a distinct meaning. Rather than reinforcing colonial fantasies, these acts can be seen as a form of resistance against societal restrictions, allowing individuals to explore their sexual identities in a context that often suppresses such expressions. This cultural backdrop is essential for understanding the complexities surrounding hijab pornography, as it reflects local desires and challenges rather than merely perpetuating stereotype made and consumed in a Muslim majority country such as Indonesia (Aprillatu, 2014), where pornography is illegal and thus most of the local porn materials are homemade and considered as an act of exploration, breaking the social norm to express their desire (Barker, 2014a).

To address the discrepancy, critical psychology approach can be used to unfold social constructionism behind the pornography materials (Barker, 2014b), investigating why the symbol of hijab is presented in such way by emphasizing the shared agreement in the definition of hijab in pornography. On that account, discussing locally made hijab pornography in a Muslim majority-country and how it may differs or shares some similar features with Western-made hijab pornography requires an understanding of the society's norm and cultural background, as well as laying a conceptual framework on how hijab is being sexualized.

This paper aims to lay out the social construction of hijab and also the possible social construction of hijab in pornography. Subsequently, the particular social

construction will be used to analyze the content of existing hijab pornography that circulates in a Muslim-majority country of Indonesia.

Indonesia's Changing Political Landscape and Attitude Toward Sexual Activity

Indonesia reached its cultural pivotal point when the "New Order" regime fell, ending the 30 years of Soeharto's presidency along with the restrictive control for ideas and expressions, followed by the rising trend of Islamic norms and values as an answer to uncertain situations at the time (Azra, 2006). What followed that point is the battle for influence between religious group who wanted to control the expression of sexuality and secular group who resisted the suppression and advocated the freedom of expression as well as embracing Indonesia's cultural diversity (Madasari, 2021).

Bellows (2011) recorded the debate between two groups when Indonesia was in the process of passing the antipornography law in 2008. For the religious group, porn is considered as the product of Western's broken morality, and thus believing that having a law that bans pornography as well as obscenity in public is the answer to keep society in order. While the secular group believed that the law only accommodated the voice and the value of the majority, disregarding many cultural practices such as dances and ethnic dresses that counted as obscenity by the antipornography law. Indonesian government finally passed the law with an exclusion for cultural practices. Bellows (2011) also argued that the whole process gave birth to "The Indonesian Peeping Tom", a group of self-righteous people who enthusiastically observe others' transgression to satisfy their curiosity as well as confirming the immorality of their peeping object. As the result, some group of people are more than ready to publicly shaming those who do any type of sexuality outside of marriage (Davies, 2014).

Ironically, with all of the public sexuality surveillance and the antipornography law, the consumption and the production of pornography in Indonesia still naturally happens on its own way. Regarding the consumption, a research on Indonesian university students revealed that the majority of participants thought that pornography consumption for adults is acceptable, a result that in accordance with samples from

Western background (Hald & Mulya, 2013). As for the production, without the existence of porn studios, distributors, or any kind of legal capitalization, Indonesian-made pornography is a homemade efforts that provide insights into contemporary sexual practice in Indonesia (Barker, 2014a). And it is in line with how pornography is produced since the era of erotic literature of 19th century, as historical records that caught the nuance of how people view sex and its expression in any particular era of interest (Hunter et al., 1993).

The prevalence of porn consumption and production in Indonesia seems to be counterintuitive, given the existing public surveillance on expression of sexuality and sex-related behaviors. And the presence of hijab pornography along with its niche consumers presents yet another discrepancy of the society's mainstream morality discourse and their behavior. In Lacanian term, pornography in Indonesia is seen as "the Other", something that is not Indonesian, and considered to be the byproduct of immoral West (Bellows, 2011). Whereas, Ghumkor (2020) argued that when it is about women with hijab, it is the Western society who consider them as "the Other", and believing that the act of unveiling is the way to reach liberation to be one's true self. Thus, there is no certain position that can be used as reference to decide who is "the Other" in a Muslim-majority society who consume hijab pornography. To understand further what does hijab symbolize in pornography among Muslims, it is important to comprehend some probable explanation on why hijab is being sexualized.

The Sexualization of Hijab

Globally, hijab has been transformed from a cold symbol that didn't elicit many responses to a hot symbol that followed by enormous responses when people brought it up more in public discussion as the new feminine aesthetics (Botz-Bornstein, 2013). The rising trend of modest fashion in public's discourse might be partially contributed by fellow Muslim who consider veiled women as more appealing as their religiosity increased (Mahmud & Swami, 2010). More specifically in Indonesia, there has been a shift on how society perceive hijab at its peak of commercialization. It evolved from the

symbol of piety to a symbol of gendered and class-related status too when hijab gradually entered the mainstream fashion and beauty industry (Jones, 2010). At this point, it can be concluded that other than being a religious modest symbol, hijab is also represent women's beauty that has its own spotlight in market and media.

From a closer look, further than just what it represents, the meaning-making of hijab involves some hints of sensualism. Despite its intended function to cover a part of women's beauty, hijab also triggers people's curiosity so they imagine what's behind the cover, just as how people guess the eye behind the sunglasses, and the imagined beauty is considerably more powerful than visually exposed beauty (Botz-Bornstein, 2013). A psychoanalytic approach on hijab meaning-making suggested by Ragland (2008) argued that veil forbid the pleasure of a woman by covering their sexuality, thus opens the whole new fantasy world to cope with that state of lack, that is, when a man finally uncover the veil he does not interpersonally connected with the woman, but rather connected with his fantasy of the imagined "other" in a way that similar to the Lacanian "other" as explained by Bellows (2011) and Ghumkor (2020).

Hijab sexual fantasy can be seen as a byproduct of socio-cultural norm where it happens. Through social psychological aspect in sex, there has been found a pattern from religious communities to fantasize things that incongruent to their commonly socialized traditional sexual script such as "utilitarian penile-vaginal intercourse with the goal of making babies", as a respond to fight the perceived threat of freedom by doing something that is being forbidden by the authority figure (Lehmiller, 2018). Such behavioral response is in line with Ragland's (2008) idea on how the act of unveiling becomes a moment when someone reclaim or finally get what is previously barred and restricted. In addition, fantasy is indeed has a function to break the cultural taboo in the society, and it is not necessarily should be done in reality (Lehmiller, 2017).

Before the emergence of hijab sexual fantasy, Indonesian mainstream literature in the late 90s had recorded a pious character turned wild and sexually adventurous to break the taboo and norms that restrained her freedom, this erotic literature shocked the country when it was published and won prestigious international awards (Bandel, 2006).

As Hunter et al. (1993) explained, erotic literature or pornography in a broader area shows the struggle for freedom of expression at the time it was created. And thus, the emergence of hijab pornography can also be seen as a historical point when hijab turned into a new symbol of beauty (Botz-Bornstein, 2013) and presumably as a challenge to religious norms that heavily restrict and forbid the talks and the acts of sex at current time.

The Present Research

Following the meaning-making of hijab in Indonesia from a symbol of rebellion to oppressive government, expression of new value post-reformation, then turned into commercialization and new symbol of aesthetic, and finally niche sexualization in pornography and prostitution, this research aimed to discover the latest, unexpected sub-culture of hijab that is hijab pornography. However, one source of available pornography that involves women with hijab is the sporadic home-made videos (Aprillatu, 2014) without scripts or notable characterization that enables researcher to analyze the dynamics in the content.

Since pornography is practically banned in Indonesia and hard to find access, we sought for alternatives where pornography are prevalent and relevant to the issue. As Ashton et al. (2019) explained, pornography can be anything that contains genitals, nudity and sexual activities in any kind of medium, even in a mere written texts. By that definition, an ecosystem of erotic stories creation and discussion in a specific internet forum in Indonesia (Kurniawan, 2021) is considered appropriate for our data source.

Method

We chose erotic stories because it doesn't focus on the sexual activity and it can portray how certain subjects are being fantasized, including their mundane activities as it recorded in du Preez (2020) analysis on short stories of the minority and underrepresented in South Africa. Erotic stories also considered as a valid form of pornography in terms of definition (Ashton et al., 2019) and effects on consumers'

arousal (Garcia et al., 1984). We also chose internet forum to gather our data source since it provides substantial user generated contents that captures a natural discussion on pornography (Taylor & Jackson, 2018; Chasioti & Binnie, 2021). In this case, we gather our data in the form of erotic stories from user generated content in a forum that is focused on sexual themes (Kurniawan, 2021).

The author joined the forum for several time to understand the norm expressed through the posts and guidelines given by the moderators in the sub-forum of erotic stories. Using the keywords of "hijab", "jilbab", and "kerudung" (name variations of Muslim's veil in Indonesian language), we selected the top stories that involved a main character of woman who wears veil. We also specified the stories that only focused on one main woman character to narrow the analysis. Finally, there are 12 stories gathered for this research which later will be coded according to the relevant information for analysis purpose.

According to Hewson and Buchanan's (2013) ethical guide for internet-mediated research, there is no need for consent to use data in public domain, but it is necessary to ensure no harm for the users and the communities. Therefore, we made the story creators anonymous and changed the names in the story so it can't be tracked back to avoid harassment or other possible negative consequences.

The data will be analyzed by using thematic analysis approach according to Braun and Clarke's (2006) guide as it has been used by Taylor and Jackson (2018) in analyzing texts from internet forum to extract the substantial themes in a community with shared understanding on certain discourses. We also consider Braun and Clarke's (2019) suggestion for generating theme in an assumed frame of shared meaning by applying specific approaches to how we produce themes in the available data. Therefore, we specifically use Clark's (2012) idea of sex as conceptual system that includes 1) Norm constructions of desirability; 2) Expressions of favorable sexual activities and 3) Hierarches of favorability and sexual qualities.

The themes appeared in the stories will also be produced through the approach of the positioning theory in regards to understand how hijabi women who are restricting

themselves from sexualization are being sexualized instead in erotic stories. Harré et al. (2009) explained that the core principle of positioning theory is that behaviors occurred because of the positions of the actors, a position that includes views of morality and norms from certain groups and subsequently assigned people to roles and expected behaviors in social setting of a particular frame. Positions held by the actors contain rights and duties in certain frame, and it can also be seen from how the actors are narrated in a story (Harré et al., 2009). Included in the positions' descriptions, there are two dynamics that can be observed. First, the dynamics of how a role or assigned position immediately manifests what the actors should do and say (Carbaugh, 1999). Second, the dynamics of intergroup relations based on group membership that explains why the actors behave in a particular way to the member of the other group (Tan & Moghaddam, 1999).

According to the conceptual system of sex and positioning theory mentioned above, we mainly aim to seek: 1) How a hijabi woman is sexualized regarding to the roles in the given social context in the stories, and 2) How desirability, pleasure, and sexual qualities are depicted around the hijabi women characters.

Result

From twelve stories gathered, the setting and the characters of the stories are varied. There are stories that involves single women and also stories that involves married women. How sexual activities are initiated and how the women are portrayed in the stories are different in those two categories. Overall, we found four major themes in these stories in terms of how women and her hijab are being positioned in sexual scripts of internet porn stories. First theme is the existence of both familiar and exotic nature of hijabi woman on the eyes of the men who have sex with them. Second theme is the sensuality of transgressive acts. Third theme is how innocent women are idealized and coveted, and finally the fourth theme we found in the stories is how hijab as a piece of cloth is being treated in the sexual activities.

Table 1.
Titles and Synopsis of The Stories

	Title	Synopsis
1	The Celeb and The Gardener	Zee is a wife of a renowned movie director. She is also a hijabi presenter and celebrity, but since the birth of her children she spent a lot of her time at home while her husband went out of town almost all of the time. One day, Zee caught her gardener masturbating to her underwear. She was shocked at first, but also curious. Eventually she saw her gardener as the answer of her unfulfilled desire due to her husband's absence.
2	A Tale of A Housewife	Lisna is a 35 years old who has a daughter, her husband is a civil servant. She routinely attended social gatherings and religious events at her neighborhood. One day, her husband's subordinate went to her house to take the laptop left on the table. They exchanged number and fell to each other, then it lead to adultery even though they came from different religious background.
3	Ajeng The Hijabi Influencer	Ajeng, a married hijabi influencer met a man who helped her walk when she had strained leg from a run. They were acquainted and the man slowly obsessed with her revealing curves. He pushed his way into her, and she was shocked at the beginning but eventually accept the fact that this is what she always wanted, even though it's morally unacceptable and she kept regretting all what happened.
4	The Whole New World of College Town	Salwa who was raised in a religious family has to go to the big city for college. She fell in love with the team leader of the organization she was in, and experienced wild romance far away from what she knew about intimate relationship.
5	Erna My Beautiful Sister in Law	A man secretly had a crush on his brother's wife up to the point where he kept fantasizing about her and had a plan to sleep with her. With a hint of aphrodisiac drugs, she reciprocated to his desire to have sex when the husband was out of town.
6	My Hijab Girlfriend	Dave is the son of the owner where Anissa works, he is from Chinese descent. While Anissa is just an ordinary woman who wears hijab. Dave has a girlfriend who lives in New York, but he is drawn to Anissa and eventually obsessed with her.
7	Rei of The White-Grey	Rei is a member of a rising girl group on YouTube. She saved hundreds of millions from her job but unfortunately she has to pay her parents' debt so she can't enjoy her own money. Until one day, she got an offer to be a celebrity escort. She took the chance and gave herself to a man who paid for her virginity.
8	Annisa's Scandal	Annisa is a mother of two, working as an assistant manager and she loves getting attention from her coworkers. When she travelled for work, her boss initiated the sexual intercourse and Annisa

- eventually surrendered to him. On the other day, her boss teased and invited their driver to join her and her boss in a threesome.
- 9 Fly Free Bella is as a college student who joined a student organization, and she has a crush with the manager in her division at the organization. She fantasizes having sex with her team leader.
- 10 Ustadzah Aini - The Sweetest Sin Aini is the third child of a religious preacher, she's 28 years old and married. She met a mixed-race man with athletic body, just what Aini always wanted in a man. Since the man is 20 years old, Aini sees him as her brother, but he sees her with passion and lust. When they finally had sex, Franz felt proud because he took her virginity since her husband's penis wasn't big enough to do it.
- 11 Bond is Lost Three couples in a car were on their way to a resort for a weekend getaway. They talked about their deepest sexual fantasy and the women agreed that they can fulfill all of the different fantasies if they have swinger sex altogether. The wives then planned how to do it and persuaded their husbands to participate.
- 12 Drunken Mistake Mila wears long hijab and she served foods and drinks when her husband friends visited, but she stayed to chat only when Bram, one of her husband's friends visited because he is polite and his wife is Mila's friend. One day, Bram helped her unconscious and intoxicated husband going back home. Seeing his friend unconscious, Bram used that chance to make Mila his sex slave and Mila felt the sensation she never felt with her husband before.
-

Theme 1 - Familiarity and Exoticism

The first question in our research was to know whether women's character in Muslim-majority society are the same as they were portrayed in Western pornography, which is foreign exotic character. Or whether the character is completely the opposite that they are wanted because they are familiar to the setting in the story and subsequently they are also closer to the audience of conservative society. We found that both are present in the stories.

Some stories presented the hijabi women as someone familiar to the men who want them. These familiar characters have similar social background such as friends, coworkers, someone from the family, or acquaintances from mutual connection. When the women are familiar, the descriptions were mostly brief and clear. As it shows on the passages from the stories bellow:

Extract 1 - From "Bond is Lost"

Here's the thing, we already know each other, right? And now we are opening up about each of our sex life. Why don't we try together something new?

Extract 2 - From "The Celeb and The Gardener"

There's a couple live with us, the wife works as our maid and the husband works as our gardener and housekeeper

Extract 3 - From "Drunken Mistake"

When my friends came to my house, she usually prepared us snacks and drinks and then left, but when it is Bram who's coming, she always chatty and friendly to him.

Extract 4 - From "Fly Free"

And I imagined Agung, a student from Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences who is also my division's team leader rubbing my vagina

Extract 5 - From "Erna My Beautiful Sister in Law"

My brother Bram has a wife named Erna. I think she's pretty, she has a clean looking face, bright skin and her sweet smile always made my heart racing whenever she was around"

On the contrary, when the characters of hijabi women are alien to the men characters, the descriptions tend to be more elaborative and sometimes subtle or presented implicitly. Most of the characters indicated different religion, and some had added differences of race and social class:

Extract 6 - From "A Tale of A Housewife"

He said to me that he often got drunk and eat pork because he is a Christian and there is no prohibition to consume those. I don't mind and I appreciate him for being honest to me

Extract 7 - From "Ajeng the Hijabi Influencer"

Then I took off Adi's shirt and damn.. I lost my words looking at his jacked torso that he probably got from his exercise routine. What caught my attention was a cross necklace on his chest, but I didn't care, I hugged him tightly

Extract 8 - From "My Hijab Girlfriend"

We're just colleague, why do they have to suspect us? Annisa and I can't be together anyway. We came from different ethnicity, race, and religion. I just thought of her as my sister, nothing more. Besides, I already have Sheila as my girlfriend.

Extract 9 - From "Ustazah Aini - The Sweetest Sin"

Franz is the only son, he was born 22 years ago in Madrid when his parents lived there. His father is Spanish and his mother is Indonesian... Although there are a lot of sexy and beautiful woman around him, no one bats his eyes. He only date them for a while or just for a hook up... Franz questioned himself whether Aini is the figure that he has been looking for, or whether it's just because Aini wore veil so she reminded him of her mother

One story in particular didn't portray different cultural background, only emphasized that those two are never acquainted and less likely to meet in their daily life setting. The story is about an older man who hires a hijabi rising star escort, a woman that he would never meet in private if there is no chance to use her service.

Extract 10 - From "Rei of The White-Grey"

"I must be dreaming! Bobby my pimp posted Rei's photo, that famous rising star" said the customer. ...He just stood there at the door speechless like a statue. It was only logical, in the whole of his life he never had a chance to meet a beautiful, sweet, and modest hijabi girl who appeared before his eyes right at that moment. ...The man stopped kissing, he looked deeply at Rei's face and amazed for the umpteenth time.

Theme 2 - Erotic Transgression

One recurring theme in portraying hijabi woman during a sexual activities is the emphasize on their religious moral upbringing that dictates the transgressive nature of premarital sex, let alone adultery and affairs. Subsequently the women characters showed how much they were enjoying the sin that they never feel before. In almost all of the stories, the characters were portrayed to feel the unimagined pleasant sensation from doing something considered morally unacceptable. One way to portray it is by showing the surprise of how good things that forbidden by religion are.

Extract 11 - From "The Celeb and The Gardener"

I never expect masturbating while sniffing and licking sperm can be this orgasmic to me. Without realizing it, I have been addicted to Johan's sperm ever since. Every time I went to the backyard laundry area, I silently waited him to finish masturbating to my lingerie and use her sperm for me to masturbate later

Extract 12 - From "Ajeng the Hijabi Influencer"

He licked my labia, then he put his tongue inside my pleasure hole, my holiest part that should only be enjoyed by Adam, my husband. But Adi gave me enormous

sensation. ...I can only surrender when he pound me, each stroke of his penis made me change my mind. His bigger penis tore my soul, beat my piety and logic.

Extract 13 - From "A Tale of Housewife"

I don't care anymore about my married status, I really enjoy this sensation that makes me crazy!

Extract 14 - From "The Whole New World of College Town"

I am afraid of pregnancy, I am afraid of society's stigma if they know I lost my virginity, I feel this massive fear inside me. But on the other hand, I feel there is a storm of lust that needs to get out

Extract 15 - From "Ustazah Aini - The Sweetest Sin"

Aini stay alone in her room, crying, because she just did an adultery, a huge sin that comes with great negative consequences. She regret why she was very responsive and cooperative doing that sin with Franz.

Another way to show the enjoyment from these transgressive sexual acts is by describing acts that never been known by the women before. The shock of exposing something completely new, and yet also pleasant to them. These passages show the sensation of being watched by other while having sex.

Extract 16 - From "The Celeb and The Gardener"

The angry face that I expected from his wife didn't show. Instead, she smiled while her husband was pounding me. I didn't know at all what happened that moment.

Extract 17 - From "Annisa's Scandal"

I feel the unimaginable sensation. I, a married women, a mother who wear hijab, am being groped by a man who is not my husband in front of another man

Theme 3 - The Allure of Innocent women

While erotic transgression revolves around the deed, there is also one specific theme regarding the sensual pleasure of breaking the rules and norms. But this theme is closer to the woman's identity as an individual. More specifically, there is a theme of how men long for an innocent woman, the one who never been pleased by sexual acts before. Innocent women who despite their married status, they never feel how good sex is until the men characters done it to them. In this theme, we can see the difference

between married women and single women when they have extramarital sex for the first time.

For the married women, this theme is expressed through sensation they never felt before with their husbands or how good the men are in sex compared to their husbands.

Extract 18 - From "The Celeb and The Gardener"

I am so aroused by what he is doing because all of this time, my husband never at once going down on me, let alone licking my butt.

Extract 19 - From "Ajeng The Influencer"

Oh god, so this is how oral sex feels! I've been married for so long with Adam and I never something like this

Extract 20 - From "Annisa's Scandal"

This is the first time I feel cunnilingus, it's ticklish but it feels so good. My husband would never want to do it, he said that it is forbidden in our religion. This is completely new to me.

Extract 21 - From "Ustazah Aini - The Sweetest Sin"

Franz felt like a champion because he just took her virginity that her husband failed to take. Franz was feeling bliss because at the first time in his life he can experience sex with a virgin

When the characters are single women, the innocence simply expressed to any kind of sexual activities that feel novel and completely new to the women. Overall, the sexual intercourses in the stories were their first time.

Extract 22 - From "The Whole New World of College Town"

"Ah.. it feels so good! Harder!" I screamed while kissing his lips. I never know it can feel this good, I no longer hold myself and start to moan louder.

Extract 23 - From "Rei and The White-Grey"

She is shocked, she never knew that a man would lick female's genitals. "Isn't that disgusting?" Rei thought. But soon after that she falls down to bed looking up and rolls around. Her chest is stretched when the man licked her clitoris.

Finally, this theme of the allure of innocent, but secretly wild, women is portrayed by the juxtaposition of the women's guilt and enjoyment. The guilt was there because the action of premarital sex or adultery are always wrong in the same religion that

brought hijab into the society. Nonetheless, there also present the enjoyment, not to dismiss the fact that the stories were pornography with the aim of arousing the consumers. It is to be expected that the stories will revolve around the celebration of sexual acts. The juxtaposition can be observed through these quotes:

Extract 24 - From "The Celeb and The Gardener"

Since that day, I got confused with my situation. Johan harassed me, but on the other hand I really liked what he did to me. I even felt bummed when he stopped groping me while I was feeling orgasmic

Extract 25 - From "A Tale of A Housewife"

I don't know why each day passed I felt a growing pleasure in this affair. I can't believe seeing myself, a married woman who wears hijab and prays everyday slowly deteriorated to be a degenerate whore

Extract 26 - From "Ajeng The Influencer"

My mouth can't hold to not moan anymore, just in a few minutes I feel orgasm from an oral sex, and it wasn't by my husband, not from my legal spouse, this is adultery! My heart is so messed up

Theme 4 - Hijab in Sexual Acts

There were several clear depictions on how hijab was used or became an important part of the sexual activities in the stories. It was usually worn as a symbol of how great a man is to be able to make women break her rules and makes them go wild as described on these quotes:

Extract 27 - From "A Tale of A Housewife"

"Don't take off your hijab, Lisna! I want to enjoy your body while you wear it, you're so beautiful with your hijab"

Extract 28 - From "Ajeng The Hijabi Influencer"

He wipes his penis with my hijab while thanking me because I gave him a better sensation compared to his wife's vagina

Extract 29 - From "The Whole New World of College Town"

"Wear the hijab, you look more beautiful that way" he said while caressing my cheek

Extract 30 - From "Annisa's Scandal"

Bram talked about his married subordinate who is also his affair partner to the driver, "She actually wears hijab, that's why I like her. There is this unique sensation from sleeping with veiled women, especially when they don't take it off while fucking."

Extract 31 - From "Ustazah Aini - The Sweetest Sin"

Their skin touches without any barrier other than long hijab wore by the woman

Discussion

In non-pornography context hijabi women, or Muslim and Arab in broader representation are seen as the whole other entity and tend to be perceived with rigid perspective of Western norms and values instead of their own social and individual identity (Ghumkor, 2020). While in pornography context, that whole other-ness are longed to be conquered in a colonial fantasy by Western society (Abujad, 2021). But that's not always the case when the pornography emerged from the society that look up to hijab and the religion that prescribed it. Our research showed that the idea of "conquering" is still relevant, but the social identity dynamics are different from how Western pornography depicted women. In a notably conservative-leaning society of Indonesia, hijabi women are also being fantasized as someone close to their identity, or having similar social background.

What matters from this research is the most prevalent theme in hijab pornography, that is the eroticism in transgression, an arousal from doing a forbidden acts. In Hunter et al. (1993) term, that this is where pornography "records" Indonesian society's struggle for their freedom to express their desire and longing that has been restricted by predominantly Islamic values. As Lehmler (2018) explained, it is a form of reactance to the symbol of authorities, people will fight in a way that is the reverse of what the authority figure wants them to comply. In this case, where Islamic values were used to restrict the expression of sexuality, the symbol of Islamic values such as hijab was then being sexualized instead.

In a way, the allure of innocent woman is similar to the popularity of Japanese adult video's iconic character of innocent young woman (*bishoujo*) in Hong Kong, in the

late 1990s as recorded in Wong and Yau (2014) ethnographic discovery. Early in the 1960s, Hong Kong government prohibited any depiction of sexual intercourse on screen, so film maker made the female characters as aggressive and as flirty as possible to compensate the absence of sexual intercourse. Along the time when the rules are not that strict anymore, Hong Kong people already looking at a character that is unique in their eyes, offered by Japanese adult video industry, initially spread through pirated VCD before it reaches mainstream market. The character is an innocent woman who is cute and passive in sexual activities, the complete opposite of common Hong Kong women's aggressive-but-no-sex characters.

The phenomena of hijab pornography in Indonesia and the popularity of Japanese *bishoujo* character in Hong Kong have again strengthen Hunter et al. (1993) notion of how pornography can be seen as an everchanging historical records that caught the nuance of how people view sex and its expression in any particular era of interest. It shows how people tried to regulate it, what kind of sex-related worries that people had at that time, and what kind of aesthetics did people like at the moment the erotic literature pieces were written. At last, we need to emphasize Braun and Clarke's (2019) consideration for undergoing thematic analysis, that themes produced in this research are the result of researchers' subjectivity with certain perspectives and approaches, and these are not a rigid categorization in epistemology regarding to the topic.

There are limitations in this research regarding the framework of the discourse of hijab pornography. First, the gender of the authors of the erotic stories cannot be identified since the forum allowed the full anonymity of the users, including not mentioning their gender. Because of that, it is difficult to understand the "positioning" discourse further that can be addressed to the gender social group of the author in imagining the sexualized hijabi women. Second, the positioning only being viewed through the through the religion-ideological perspective, there was no explanation about the power relation, the patriarchal theme, and the other possibly relevant perspectives. Third, the framework was narrowly based on Indonesian society's hardship to express their sexuality and thus generating the themes in this research. These

limitations also state our focus of expressing desires and fantasy by answering the "how" hijabi women are being sexualized, but not the "why" the authors or the readers want it that way.

Conclusion

In a plot-driven erotica, hijab pornography in Indonesia seems to manifest detailed fantasies about women in hijab. Even though the clothing was intended to cover the sensuality of women and aimed to promote modesty, there are some themes where it still being able to be sexualized. First, the existence of hijabi women characters as "women next door", something that is close to Indonesians daily life have brought the fantasy closer to daily life. At the same time, hijabi women also being seen as an exotic group by men characters outside the Muslim communities. Second, there was a heightened sensuality from transgressive acts, as portrayed by hijabi women characters who had extra-marital sexual relationship. Third, hijabi women characters became a representation of innocent women in general that become a specific interest for Asian society. To sum up, this research may bring some insights on the counterintuitive phenomenon of why the symbol of modesty also becomes a symbol of sensuality for a specific group of people. The findings in this research should be able to give a better understanding on Indonesian society and their complex relationship with sexual activities and expressions.

Suggestion

This research only showed how hijabi women are being sexualized through erotic stories and should not be interpreted as why they are being sexualized. This research should not be used to normalize or desensitize transgressive and non-consensual sexual acts. It may be used as an insight about the dynamics of fantasies and as a conversation starter about our culture instead.

References

- Abujad, I. M. (2021). Desiring Empire: The Colonial Violence of "Hijab Pornography". In N. Zouidi (Ed.) *Performativity of Villainy and Evil in Anglophone Literature and Media* (pp. 55-69). Palgrave Macmillan, Cham.

- Aprillatu, P. D. (2014, September 8). Jaringan pelacur berjilbab di Internet [Hijabi escort network on the internet]. *Merdeka*. Retrieved from <https://www.merdeka.com/khas/jaringan-pelacur-berjilbab-di-internet-pelacur-berjilbab-5.html>
- Azra, A. (2006). *Indonesia, Islam, and democracy: Dynamics in a global context*. Sheffield: Equinox Publishing.
- Bandel, K. (2006). *Sastra, perempuan, seks [Literature, women, and sex]*. Yogyakarta: Jalasutra
- Barker, T. (2014). Sex on Indonesia's screens. In L. R. Bennett. & S.G. Davies (Eds.). *Sex and sexualities in contemporary Indonesia* (pp. 271-290). Routledge.
- Botz-Bornstein, T. (2013). Veils and sunglasses. *Journal of Aesthetics & Culture*, 5(1), 19659, doi: 10.3402/jac.v5i0.19659
- Braun, V. & Clarke, V. (2006) Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology* 3(2): 77–101. doi: 10.1191/1478088706QP063OA
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2019). Reflecting on reflexive thematic analysis. *Qualitative research in sport, exercise and health*, 11(4), 589-597. doi: 10.1080/2159676X.2019.1628806
- Carbaugh, D. (1999). Positioning as a display of cultural identity. In R. Harré & L. van Langenhove (Eds.). *Positioning theory: Moral contexts of intentional action* (pp. 160-177). Blackwell Publishers
- Chasioti, D., & Binnie, J. (2021). Exploring the etiological pathways of problematic pornography use in NoFap/PornFree rebooting communities: A critical narrative analysis of internet forum data. *Archives of Sexual Behavior*, 50(5), 2227-2243. doi: 10.1007/s10508-021-01930-z
- Clark, J. (2012). *Language, sex and social structure: Analysing discourses of sexuality*. Palgrave Macmillan.
- du Preez, J. B. (2020). 'Rediscovering the Erotic as Ordinary' in South African Women's Short Fiction. *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 46(4), 689-702. doi: 10.1080/03057070.2020.1792123
- Garcia, L. T., Brennan, K., DeCarlo, M., McGlennon, R., & Tait, S. (1984). Sex differences in sexual arousal to different erotic stories. *Journal of Sex Research*, 20(4), 391-402. doi: 10.1080/00224498409551235
- Ghumkhor, S. (2020). *The Political Psychology of the Veil: The Impossible Body*. Springer Nature.
- Hald, G.M. & Malamuth, N.M. (2008). Self-perceived effects of pornography consumption. *Archives of Sexual Behavior*, 37(4), 614–625. doi: 10.1007/s10508-007-9212-1
- Hald, G. M., & Štulhofer, A. (2016). What types of pornography do people use and do they cluster? Assessing types and categories of pornography consumption in a large-scale online sample. *The Journal of Sex Research*, 53(7), 849-859. doi: 10.1080/00224499.2015.1065953
- Hay, A.M. (2015, August 1). Shockingly, a porno featuring hijabis and niqabis is not very sensitive toward Islam. *Vice*. Retrieved from

- <https://www.vice.com/da/article/3bjkm8/shockingly-a-hijab-niqab-porno-is-not-very-sensitive-toward-islam-253>
- Harré, R., Moghaddam, F. M., Cairnie, T. P., Rothbart, D., & Sabat, S. R. (2009). Recent advances in positioning theory. *Theory & psychology*, 19(1), 5-31. doi: 10.1177/0959354308101417
- Hewson, C., & Buchanan, T. (2013). *Ethics guidelines for internet-mediated research*. Leicester: The British Psychological Society.
- Hunter, I., Saunders, D., & Williamson, D. (1993). *On pornography. Literature, sexuality, and obscenity law*. London: The Macmillan Press.
- Jones, C. (2010). Materializing piety: gendered anxieties about faithful consumption in contemporary urban Indonesia. *American Ethnologist*, 37(4), 617-627. doi: 10.1111/j.1548-1425.2010.01275.x
- Kurniawan, M. L. D. (2021). Kenikmatan naratif dan estetika cerita lucu dalam Forum Semprot: Sebuah kajian pornografi [Narrative pleasure and aesthetic of erotic stories on Forum Semprot: A pornography analysis]. Universitas Gajah Mada Repository. <http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/penelitian/detail/202942>
- Lehmiller, J. J. (2017). *The psychology of human sexuality*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Lehmiller, J. J. (2018). *Tell me what you want: The science of sexual desire and how it can help you improve your sex life*. Hachette UK.
- Madasari, O. (2021). Shall we dance? Defining sexuality and controlling the body in contemporary Indonesia. *Religions*, 12(4), 264. doi: 10.3390/rel12040264
- Madison, K., and Madison, R. (Producers), & Madison, R. (Director). (2015). *Women of the Middle East* [DVD]. United States: Kelly Madison Networks
- Mahmud, Y., & Swami, V. (2010). The influence of the hijab (Islamic head-cover) on perceptions of women's attractiveness and intelligence. *Body Image*, 7, 90-93. doi: 10.1016/j.bodyim.2009.09.003
- Ragland, E. (2008). The masquerade, the veil, and the phallic mask. *Psychoanalysis, Culture & Society*, 13(1), 8-23. doi: 10.1057/palgrave.pcs.2100153
- Tan, S.L., & Moghaddam, F. M. (1999). Positioning in intergroup relations. In R. Harré & L. van Langenhove (Eds.). *Positioning theory: Moral contexts of intentional action* (pp. 178-194). Blackwell Publishers
- Taylor, K., & Jackson, S. (2018). 'I want that power back': Discourses of masculinity within an online pornography abstinence forum. *Sexualities*, 21(4), 621-639. doi: 10.1177/1363460717740248
- Wong, H. W., & Yau, H. Y. (2014). Japanese adult videos in Taiwan and Hong Kong. In *Routledge Handbook of Sexuality Studies in East Asia* (pp. 432-444). Routledge.